

# City of Cincinnati



Interdepartmental  
Correspondence Sheet

Date 7/24/12

To Georgetta Kelly, Human Resources Department  
From Joel D. Estes, Director of Emergency Communications  
Copies to David Holmes, Assistant City Manager  
Subject Compensation Review

---

This memo is in response to a recent meeting I had with Assistant City Manager David Holmes. Mr. Holmes and I met to discuss your revised memo regarding compensation for my position. After I expressed several concerns with your findings, Mr. Holmes recommended I reduce these concerns to writing and forward them to you for review.

Before I get to my concerns, however, I would like to express my appreciation for your hard work on what was undoubtedly a challenging endeavor. Emergency Communications is a unique field with a variety of organizational structures, unlike the more traditional Police Departments and Fire Departments, so I thank you for your time and efforts.

## Market Analysis

The chart indicates that the manager of the Dayton Regional Communications Center has a salary of \$93,938. The Dayton Regional Communications Center is a division of the Montgomery Sheriff's Office, and the salary reflected in the report is consistent with a Captain in the Sheriff's office. The Captain, however, is a manager with limited decision-making authority. Ultimate responsibility rests with the Sheriff. In the same way, Indianapolis is under the control of the Marion County Sheriff's Office and the recorded salary is for a Major in the Sheriff's Office.

The salary reflected for the manager of the Columbus Communications Center (\$113,000) is for a Police Captain. In this case, the Center is not consolidated, so the Police Captain has a counterpart, a Battalion Chief, in the Fire Department. The Battalion Chief runs Fire Communications and has a slightly lower salary (\$106,000). Again, neither of these managers is ultimately responsible for the Communications Center. Ultimate responsibility sits two levels higher, with the Chief. Toledo operates in the same manner, with a Fire Captain and a Police Captain sharing the responsibilities for running the Communications Center. The salary posted on the chart is for a Toledo Police Captain. In order for the chart to accurately reflect the salaries of management personnel in Columbus and Toledo, there should be another column for the Fire managers which would effectively double the cost of managing their operations.

The issue that I raise with the above managers is that they don't have the same level of responsibility or authority as Cincinnati's Emergency Communications Manager's position which acts as a Department Head. And in the cases of Columbus and Toledo, there are two managers, each with less responsibility than the ECC Manager, but both make an approximately equivalent salary.

### Scope of Work

The Scope of Work assessment lists two areas where there appear to be variances, “Level of Supervisory Responsibility” and “Span of Stakeholder Relations.” The analysis dismisses the variance associated with the Span of Stakeholder Relations due to a lack of correlation with compensation, but it doesn’t explain the impact of Level of Supervisory Responsibility on compensation. The chart suggests that Cincinnati’s Emergency Communications Manager has responsibility for significantly more Full Time Employees than the other call-centers (32% more than the next largest call-center), but there appears to be no weight given to this.

### Job Family Analysis

The Job Family Analysis seems to suggest that due to the large number of classifications within the Division 8 pay scale, it is not possible to determine whether the Emergency Communications Manager position is properly positioned.

However, when looking at the “reports to” structure, Emergency Communications is a division of the City Manager’s Office. The other divisions of the City Manager’s Office according to the 2012 budget are:

- Budget and Evaluation with 13 FTE’s and \$1.5 million budget
- Economic Development with 7 FTE’s and \$2.3 million budget
- Communications with 6 FTE’s and \$2.6 million budget
- Environmental Quality with 6 FTE’s and \$2.6 million budget

The Emergency Communications Center, with 132 FTE’s and a \$10 million budget, is larger than all of these divisions combined and is actually larger than many city departments. And yet, each of the above divisions is headed by a Division 5 employee while the Emergency Communications Manager is a Division 8 employee.

### Conclusion

After studying your Compensation Review, I am left with some concerns. The Market Analysis, although thorough, doesn’t take into account the level of responsibility of the managers whose salaries are posted. In most of the cases cited, the managers of the call centers whose salaries are posted are not the ultimate decision-makers, and in some cases the duties are split between two managers.

The Scope of Work implies that there is a correlation between the Level of Supervisory Responsibility and compensation level. The chart depicts a significant variance between the FTE’s working at each agency, but this is never explored. Is there some weight that should be given to this variance? If not, why is this dimension included in the analysis?

With regard to the Job Family Analysis, I am not aware of any other employee within the city who has a similar number of FTE’s, a similar size budget, and the responsibilities of a Department Head while falling in the Division 8 category. I am therefore requesting that the analysis be revisited so that these issues might be addressed. Once again, I appreciate your time and effort in addressing my concerns.